International Journal of Human Capital in Urban Management

(IJHCUM)

Homepage: http://www.ijhcum.net/

CASE STUDY

Evaluation of training courses applied in succession planning in organizations using the CIPP model

S. Tootian

Department of Management, Islamic Azad University, East Tehran Branch, Tehran, Iran

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT
	The objective of this study was to examine the evaluation of training courses applied in succession planning in organizations using the CIPP model. This was an applied research in terms of purpose and descriptive-survey in terms of data gathering type. Statistical population of the study included 100 employees of Chamber of Commerce, of which a sample size of 80 people were selected using the random sampling method and Cochran formula. Face validity and content validity were also used to assess the validity of questionnaire and Cronbach's alpha coefficient was used to calculate its reliability that the value of them was higher than 0.7, and the results indicated the validity and reliability of the researcher-made questionnaire. To analyze the data, with respect to research questions, descriptive statistics (mean, standard deviation, frequency distribution tables and charts) and inferential statistics (confirmatory factor analysis and one-sided one-sample t test) were applied using SPSS and PLS software. The results revealed that context, input, output (product) and process components in the evaluation model of training courses used in succession planning are at a favorable level.

INTRODUCTION

During recent years that the concept of human resources has been replaced by human capital, and development of knowledge is intended as the most important basis of human civilization, dealing with organizational issues needs more human knowledge and talent rather than the need for technology and the use of advanced equipment. Undoubtedly, recruitment of capable and competent human capital in organizations is an essential issue, but investigations show that many organizations are facing problems in the field and they do not have the ability to keep their people as organizational capitals (Cartwright and Pappas, 2008). One of the new programs of human capital management to attract and retain individuals and identify their potential talents is the talent management and succession planning (Cappelli and Keller, 2014). Generally, succession planning is a program in which proper people for charging key positions of an organization are selected from among qualified and talented individuals (Barnett and Davis, 2008). The issue of succession planning and talent management in the Chambers of Commerce is of double importance because these organizations play a crucial role in country's economic prosperity. As well as, exit of people from different levels of organizations, due to various reasons such as resignation, retirement,

*Corresponding Author:
Email: tootian_ir@yahoo.com
Tel.: +9896029198
Fax: +9884312303

job promotion, or even death, is inevitable, and if there is no a thinking in a systematic and planned way to compensate the gap caused by the lack of these people, organizations and institutions will face issues such as empting key positions or filling these positions with people who do not have the necessary talent and competence (Rothwell, 2016). The more organization's management believing the issues such as participation of employees in decision making, confidentiality of employees in restating information to them, use of teamwork with the support of organization and appreciation of a good performance, the situation of human resource empowerment in the organization will be at higher favorable level (Ziaie *et al*., 2014). In addition to improving the flow of information in organizations and improving the decision-making process, the role of participation also accelerates the formation of a group of promoters and can lead to improvements in the dimensions of manpower productivity (Allameh *et al*., 2014). The core issue raised in this research is the challenge called "evaluation of training programs." Because today human resources are the most valuable factor of production and the most important capital of any organization and the main source generating competitive advantage and creating basic capabilities of each organization, so one of the major organizational planning is Human Resource Planning (HRP). An important factor for the existence of HRP is planning to attain the skill and training needs, and ultimately improve the human resources (Lavieri and Puterman, 2009). The most effective way for achieving a competitive advantage in the current situation is to make employees of organizations more efficient by promoting and improving those (DeCenzo *et al*., 2016). The significant thing in developing human resources is that improvement of human resources is not achieved by technical and specialized training, but the use of motivational means can also be considered as a factor in improving their performance (Werner and DeSimone, 2011). One of the evaluation models that can be helpful in this regard is the Context, Input, Process and Product Model (CIPP Model). CIPP Evaluation Model is an evaluation system, which focuses on evaluating the entire process of a program or a project. The main purpose of this kind of evaluation is a method for judgment and uses both quantitative and qualitative methods, and it is expected that the most required

information with a purposeful and realistic approach be provided (Stufflebeam and Zhang, 2017). CIPP model emphasizes the transparency of goals and intentions of the program, and recommends regular observation to find out whether the goals and intentions have been met or not (Divayana *et al*., 2017). The mentioned definition is the basis of a model known in sources using the combination of first letters of the four words of context, input, process, and product called CIPP (CIPP in Persian sources). CIPP model provides a comprehensive framework for evaluation in various fields, including training programs. The most important evaluation objective in the CIPP model is to improve the performance of program. This model helps program managers, by collecting data on a regular basis, to reform their program during the implementation of program and at the end of its implementation. CIP evaluation model judges on the quality of educational elements and provides appropriate information for training decision makers. With the development of indicators system, the whole educational system can be displayed. The indicator is a statistic that shows an aspect of the system performance about the educational system (Hadavand *et al*., 2014). In most cases, it is seen that organizations consider their employees like robots that should only be executors of orders of the organization's senior managers. While knowledge-based, entrepreneurial, creative and innovative organizations, summarily, all organizations seeking to increase the productivity of their human resources as the most valuable source of the organization consider all dimensions that weaken the organization's human resource base as a dilemma and take steps to train employees and deal with the problem (Quintane *et al*., 2011). But the question is whether these trainings could be effective in empowering people and nurturing competent and succeeding manpower? Meanwhile, pitfalls of the evaluation system are the tendency to subjectivism and the moving away from objectivity (Brockbank and McGil, 2007). This occurs when the objective and tangible and measurable indicators, criteria and standards are not available to the evaluators and, for evaluating, they resort their self-made subjective criteria (Khanzadi *et al*., 2017). This makes the evaluation risky. To evaluate educational programs of the organization's in the human resources department as a unit with both commercial and educational aspects, a detailed and

logical system based on specific indicators should be designed for evaluating all aspects of a training program. Thus, it is necessary that the indicators are fully developed, identified and validated so that the evaluation of the HR unit training programs, which is the commercial and administrative unit of the organization's operational programs, be conducted realistically (Pineda, 2010; Gatewood *et al.,* 2015). Succession planning is a set of measures that identify the internal people of organizations, who enjoy inherent preparedness for carrying out more and more complex responsibilities, and prepare them with development plans for new and key jobs (Hills, 2009). Talent and succession planning programs support the talented people to staying in the organization.

Mansouri *et al.,* (2016) in their study provided grounds for satisfaction of the participants through examining the quality of training courses in four dimensions of CIPP model, i.e. the quality of training courses in dimensions of context, input, process and product. Rezapour *et al.,* (2016) also evaluated the educational performance of Ardakan University based on the CIPP model and indicated that both faculty members and students in all four dimensions of context, input, process and product reported the educational performance at a desirable level. In addition, Makarem *et al.,* (2014) undertook the evaluation of educational status in Department of Oral Health and Social Dentistry, School of Dentistry, Mashhad by the CIPP evaluation model and showed that the areas of context, input and process of oral health and social dentistry education programs were relatively favorable and the area of output (product) was unfavorable. Among the relevant foreign researches, Panya *et al.,* (2017) evaluated environmental management of Thailand government and measured the relationship between management factors (context, input, process) and its output. Results of this study revealed that there was a positive and significant relationship between input and context and output, but there was no relationship between process and output. Hasan *et al.,* (2016) also evaluated the documents in the field of mechatronics using the CIPP model and showed that the evaluation model dimensions of the program of several top universities in Malaysia were accepted and agreed by students of the discipline. Abdullah *et al.,* (2016) using the CIPP model, evaluated the effectiveness of teachers in Malaysian schools and demonstrated that

the context, input and product were of an acceptable level and output was at a highly desirable level. The study also seeks to achieve answers of the following questions:

Sub Questions:

Are the context components in the evaluation model of training courses used in succession planning at a desirable level?

Are the input components in the evaluation model of training courses used in succession planning at a desirable level?

Are the process components in the evaluation model of training courses used in succession planning at a desirable level?

Are the output (product) components in the evaluation model of training courses used in succession planning at a desirable level?

This research was conducted at the offices of the Ministry of Cooperatives, Labor, and Social Welfare in (Iran- Tehran) in 2018.

Fig. 1 shows the basic conceptual model of study

General model of the CIPP pattern (Stufflebeam and Zhang, 2017) was used to conduct the current research.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Because the present study sought to provide an evaluation model of training courses applied in succession planning in organizations using the CIPP model, the research method was quantitative in terms of data nature, documentary field type one in terms of environment dimension, applied study in terms of purpose, cross-sectional study in terms of time, and descriptive-survey research in terms of procedure. Statistical population of the study included 100 Chamber of Commerce employees, of which a sample size of 80 people were selected using the random sampling method and Cochran formula. To collect the data, library (desk) method and questionnaire were used in this research. In the study, to collect data, a researcher-made questionnaire derived from codes of the interview was used, which was completed by a survey of managers of the offices of the Ministry of Cooperatives, Labor, and Social Welfare. The items of questionnaires of this study consisted of two parts:

A) General items: The purpose of general questions was to obtain the general and demographic information of the respondents. This section

Fig. 1: General model of the CIPP pattern (Stufflebeam and Zhang, 2017)

consisted of five questions, and issues such as gender, age, education, work experience in the field of human resources were proposed. B) Special items (evaluation questionnaire of training courses applied in succession planning in organizations using the CIPP model): This section included 19 closed items and 1 open question. To design the section, it was tried to make the questionnaire items understandable to the respondents as much as possible. The items were of the closed type and of the 5-point Likert scale. It is worth mentioning that, at the time of distributing the questionnaire, researcher was present at the site and verbally attempted to clarify the contents and items of the questionnaire and eliminate the ambiguities for the subjects. The questionnaire measured the different dimensions of the evaluation model variables of training courses based on Stufflebeam and Zhang systemic approach (2017) the questionnaire consisted of 5 demographic questions, 19 questions with an optional 9-point Likert scale, and 1 open-ended question at the end. In order to calculate the validity, face validity, content validity and construct validity were used in this study. Face validity of the final questionnaire was developed without any editing, forming, spelling, and.... mistakes by the researcher, several members of the sample, supervisor and advisor. To evaluate content validity, the views of supervisor and advisor professors were used and necessary revisions were intended. According to this type of validity, no questions needed to be deleted and some questions

were revised. Factor analysis was also used for construct validity. Reliability: In this study, Cronbach's alpha coefficient was used to calculate the reliability. The value of Cronbach's alpha coefficient for all components was higher than 0.7. However, it should be noted that the Cronbach's alpha pretest was separately performed on 30 subjects and, after we found that the internal consistency of questions was proper, the final questionnaire was distributed to other subjects. Testing of the research hypotheses in inferential part was performed using SPSS and Smart partial least squares (PLS) software. And confirmatory factor analysis method to determine the reliability and measures of the evaluation model variables to determine and confirm the load factor and one-sided one-sample t test to check the approval of dimensions of each of the model variables were used.

RESULTS AND DISSCUSION

In this section, research data are analyzed and evaluated using scientific methods in a quantitative section; but before analyzing the data, pre-processing of data was examined.

Checking the normality of research variables

Normality of data related to the research variables was examined using Kolmogorov-Smirnov and Shapiro-Wilk tests, the results of which are reflected in Table 1.

Table 1 shows that the significance level in all variables is greater than 0.05, which means that the

Table 1: Summary of Shapiro-Wilk and Kolmogorov-Smirnov tests for the studied components

		Context Variables	input Variables	process Variables	product Variables
N		81	81	81	81
Normal Parameters a,b	Mean	5.5833	6.1544	5.5586	5.6420
	Std. Deviation	1.65028	1.09782	1.51980	1.27032
Most Extreme Differences	Absolute	0.111	0.083	0.080	0.092
	Positive	0.059	0.048	0.071	0.040
	Negative	-0.111	-0.083	-0.080	-0.092
Kolmogorov-Smirnov Z		1.002	0.743	0.718	0.832
Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed)		0.268	0.638	0.682	0.493

Table 2: One-sample t-test of context variable

Context tot	Test Value = 7					
	t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
					Lower	Upper
	-7.726	80	0.000	-1.41667	-1.7816	-1.0518

Table 3: One-sample t-test of input variable

input variable	Test Value = 7					
	t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
					Lower	Upper
	-6.932	80	0.000	-.84556	-1.0883	-.6028

Table 4**:** One-sample t-test of process variable

process variable	Test Value = 7					
	t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
					Lower	Upper
	-8.535	80	0.000	-1.44136	-1.7774	-1.1053

distribution related to all factors is normal.

Hypothesis 1: Context components in the evaluation model of training courses used in succession planning are at a desirable level.

To test the first hypothesis, one-sample t-test was used. Table 2 shows the results.

In Table 2, a significance value (sig) of 0.000 was obtained. So null hypothesis can be rejected and H1 is accepted. According to upper and lower limits of the statistics, it can be concluded that the mean is less than 7, and the hypothesis is raised in this way: Context components in the evaluation model of training courses used in succession planning are not at a desirable level.

*Hypothesis 2***:** Input components in the evaluation model of training courses used in succession planning are at a desirable level.

Table 3 shows the results of one-sample t-test for the second hypothesis.

In Table 3, a significance value (sig) of 0.000 was obtained. So null hypothesis can be rejected and H1 is accepted. According to upper and lower limits of the statistics, it can be concluded that the mean is less than 7, and the hypothesis is raised in this way: Input components in the evaluation model of training courses used in succession planning are not at a desirable level.

*Hypothesis 3***:** Process components in the evaluation model of training courses used in succession planning are at a desirable level.

Table 4 shows the results of one-sample t-test for the third hypothesis.

In Table 4, a significance value (sig) of 0.000 was obtained. So null hypothesis can be rejected and H1 is accepted. According to upper and lower limits of the statistics, it can be concluded that the mean is

Table 5: One-sample t-test of product variable

product variable	t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
					Lower	Upper
	-9.621	80	0.000	-1.35802	-1.6389	-1.0771

less than 7, and the hypothesis is raised in this way: Process components in the evaluation model of training courses used in succession planning are not at a desirable level.

Hypothesis 4: Product components in the evaluation model of training courses used in succession planning are at a desirable level.

Table 5 shows the results of one-sample t-test for the fourth hypothesis.

In Table 5, a significance value (sig) of 0.000 was obtained. So null hypothesis can be rejected and H1 is accepted. According to upper and lower limits of the statistics, it can be concluded that the mean is less than 7, and the hypothesis is raised in this way: Product components in the evaluation model of training courses used in succession planning are not at a desirable level.

CONCLOUSION

Results of this study offer a more comprehensive understanding of HR performance evaluation factors in succession planning training courses that, with its application, estimating the performance of its constituent components can be done with higher accuracy and provide better results for evaluators. Findings of this research, both in terms of theory and in terms of management perspective, can be used in the field of human resources, some of which are mentioned in the following. The factors of human resources evaluation model based on CIPP model include: input, context, process and output (product). The principle of having a systemic approach to management, implementation and design of a program or a project is that it clearly determines what we wish to achieve (output, results, and product), which method is best (process) and what we need (input). Among the evaluation models of programs, which consider the organizations and its plans, not people and human resources, CIPP model focuses on clarifying goals and intentions of the program and recommends regular observation to find out whether the goals and intentions have been fulfilled or not.

The CIPP model is distinguished from other models due to its comprehensiveness, continuity, as well as objective aimed at guiding the decision-making function in management of programs. To evaluate a system using the CIPP model, the current and desired status of the environment and context is initially measured, so that the quality of system objectives be determined. Then, the system outputs (products) are evaluated that the CIPP model, because of its comprehensiveness, continuity, as well as objective aimed at guiding the decision-making function in management of programs, is distinguished from other models. In the CIPP evaluation model, during the evaluation, evaluator should interact regularly with the evaluation subject, discuss on it, record the results, and, if necessary, revise the plans and programs and change them. In order to evaluate a system using the CIPP model, the current and desired status of the environment and context is initially measured, so that the quality of system objectives be determined. Then, outputs (products) of the system are evaluated that to what extent have the implementation programs and plans to meet the objectives been successful and effective? This model helps managers, planners, and program officials, with receiving systematic feedback from the procedure of affairs, put the essential needs at the agenda and provide existing resources in the service of best kind of activities. Components of the model are applied to guide decision making. The results of this study are in line with the results of researches conducted by Mansouri and Shariatmadari (2016), Rezapour *et al*. (2016), Makarem *et al.,* (2014), Panya *et al.,* (2017), Hasan *et al*., (2016) and Abdullah *et al*., (2016). To implement the CIPP model in an organization, the following measures are suggested:

A working group consisting of managers of different units be established.

Members of the group, during a workshop, be get acquainted with the objectives and methods of the CIPP evaluation and how to do it.

A defined and regular program for holding

meetings of the working group be set.

The first programs of the group are to determine the desirable training indexes in four dimensions of context, input, process, and output.

The most important program of the group is data collection on the existing situation in all four dimensions of the CIPP model in accordance with the specified indexes.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

CONFLICT OF INTREST

The author declares that there is no conflict of interests regarding the publication of this manuscript. In addition, the ethical issues, including plagiarism, informed consent, misconduct, data fabrication and/or falsification, double publication and/or submission, and redundancy has been completely observed by the authors.

REFERENCES

Abdullah, N.; Wahab, N.A.; Noh, N.M.; Abdullah, E.M; Ahmad, A., (2016). The evaluation and effectiveness of school based assessment among science teachers in Malaysia using CIPP Model. Int. J. Adv. Appl. Sci., 3(11): 1-7 **(7 Pages).** (In Persian)

Allameh, S. M.; Soltani, F.; Narimani, M., (2014). Presenting strategies for the implementation of succession management. Q. j. hum. Resour. Manage. Res. 6(3): 164-139 **(26 Pages)**. (In Persian)

Brockbank, A.; McGill, I., (2007). Facilitating reflective learning in higher education. McGraw-Hill Education (UK).

Barnett, R.; Davis, S., (2008). Creating greater success in succession planning. Adv. Dev. Hum. Resour. 10(5):721-739 **(19 pages)**.

Cappelli, P.; Keller, J.R., (2014). Talent management: Conceptual approaches and practical challenges. Annu. Rev. Organ. Psychol. Organ. Behav., 1(1): 305-331 **(27 pages)**.

Cartwright, S.; Pappas, C., (2008). Emotional intelligence, its measurement and implications for the workplace. Int. J. Manag. Rev., 10(2): 149-171 **(23 pages)**.

DeCenzo, D.A.; Robbins, S.P.; Verhulst, S.L., (2016). Fundamentals of Human Resource Management, Binder Ready Version. John Wiley and Sons.

Divayana, D.G.H.; Sanjaya, D.B.; Marhaeni, N.; Istri, A.A.; Sudirtha, I., (2017). CIPP evaluation model based on mobile phone in evaluating the use of blended learning platforms at vocational schools in Bali. J. Theor. Appl. Info. Technol., 95(9): 1983- 1995 **(13 pages)**.

Khanzadi, K.; Jafari, P.; Ghourchiyan, N.G., (2017) To Develop and Accredit Criteria and Indicators for   Administration Quality Assessment of Iran's High Schools. (First grade) in Tehran City, Ir.

J. Edu. Sociol., 1(7), 14-26 **(22 pages)**.

Gatewood, R.; Feild, H.S.; Barrick, M., (2015). Human resource selection. Nelson Education.

Hadavand, S.; Rahimi, R.; Darabi, M., (2014). Accreditation of the CIPP evaluation model in the performance of educational centers. Case Study: National Iranian Petrochemical Company. Leadersh. Res. Educ. Manage., 1 (1): 119-136 **(18 pages)**. (In Persian)

Hasan, A.; Yasin, S.N.T.M.; Yunus, M.F.M., (2016). Technical competency for diploma in mechatronic engineering at polytechnics Malaysia. Int. Rev. Manage. Market. 6(4S): 196-199 **(4 pages)**.

Hills, A.; (2009). Succession planning–or smart talent management? Ind. Commer. Train., 41(1): 3-8 **(6 pages)**.

Lavieri, M.S.; Puterman, M.L., (2009). Optimizing nursing human resource planning in British Columbia. Health Care Manage. Sci., 12(2): 119-128 **(10 pages)**.

Makarem, A.; Movahed, T.; Sarabadani, J; Shakeri, M.; Asadiyan, L.T; Islam, N., (2014). Evaluation of the status of education in oral health and social dentistry faculty of dental faculty of Mashhad with the help of CIPP evaluation model in the academic year of 93-91. J. Faculty. Dentistry. Mashhad, 38 (4): 347-362 **(16 pages)**. (In Persian)

Mansouri.K, B.; Shariatmadari, M., (2016). Evaluation of employee satisfaction from in-service training courses based on the Cip model (case study of Turbo-compressor companies). Q. J. Hum. Res. Educ. Dev., 3 (11): 73-91 **(19 pages)**. (In Persian)

Panya, N.; Paboon, Ch.; Phoochinda, W.; Teungfung , R., (2018). The performance of the environmental management of local governments in Thailand. Kasetsart. J. Social Sci. 39 (1): 33- 41 **(9 pages)**.

Pineda, P., (2010). Evaluation of training in organizations: a proposal for an integrated model. J. European. Ind. Train., 34(7):.673-693 **(21 pages)**.

Quintane, E.; Mitch Casselman, R.; Sebastian Reiche, B.; Nylund, P.A., (2011). Innovation as a knowledge-based outcome. J. knowl. Manage., 15(6): 928-947 **(20 pages)**.

Rothwell, W. J., (2016). Effective succession planning: Ensuring leadership continuity and building talent from within. AMACOM Div American Mgmt Assn.

Rowe, C. D., (2018). Assessing a Study Skills Freshman Academy Program in a Rural Georgia School District: A CIPP Program Evaluation.

Rezapur Mirasal, Y.; Atri Ardakani, S.A.; Behjati Ardekani, F., (2016). Educational Performance Evaluation of University of Ardakan based on CIPP Model. High. Educ. Letter, 9(36): 7- 30 **(24 pages)**. (In Persian)

Werner, J. M.; DeSimone, R. L., (2011). Human resource development. Cengage Learning.

Stufflebeam, D. L.; Zhang, G., (2017). The CIPP evaluation model: How to evaluate for improvement and accountability. Guilford Publications.

Yasin, S. N. T. M.; Yunus, M. F. M.; Baser, J. A.; Wahab, N. B. A.; Hasan, A., (2016). Evaluation Process Dimensions To The Diploma In Mechatronics Engineering. Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences, 228, 272-277 **(5 pages)**.

Ziaie, M.S.; Seyedjavadin, S.R.; Hosainian, s.; Fattahi, M., (2014). Success Factors for Succession Program in the Private Sector (Case Study: Alpha Holding). Q. J. Gov. Manage., 6 (4): 747-767 **(21 pages)**. (In Persian)